

ANTIQUITIES ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of the 141st Meeting
held on Friday, 18 December 2009 at 3:00 p.m.
in Conference Room, Hong Kong Heritage Discovery Centre
Kowloon Park, Haiphong Road, Tsim Sha Tsui, Kowloon

- Present: Mr Bernard Charnwut Chan, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Dr Anissa Chan Wong Lai-kuen, MH, JP
Mr Philip Kan Siu-lun
Mr Kwong Hoi-ying
Professor Lau Chi-pang
Ms Lilian Law Suk-kwan
Dr Lee Ho-yin
Mr Laurence Li Lu-jen
Professor Bernard Lim Wan-fung, JP
Dr Tracey Lu Lie-dan
Dr Ng Cho-nam, BBS, JP
Professor Simon Shen Xu-hui
Professor Billy So Kee-long
Ir Dr Greg Wong Chak-yan, JP
Ms Heaster Cheung (Secretary)
Chief Administration Manager (Antiquities and
Monuments)
Leisure and Cultural Services Department
- Absent with Apologies: Mrs Mariana Cheng Cho Chi-on, BBS, JP
Ms Susanna Chiu Lai-kuen
Mr Patrick Fung Pak-tung, SC
Mr Andrew Lam Siu-lo, JP
Mr Ng Yat-cheung, JP
Mr Almon Poon Chin-hung, JP
Dr Linda Tsui Yee-wan
Mr Bryan Wong Kim-yeung
Mr Yeung Yiu-chung, BBS, JP

- In Attendance: Development Bureau

Mr Jack Chan
Commissioner for Heritage

Mr Ku Kwok-pun
Acting AS(Heritage Conservation)⁴

Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Mr Chung Ling-hoi, JP
Deputy Director (Culture)

Dr Louis Ng
Assistant Director (Heritage and Museums)

Mr Tom Ming
Executive Secretary (Antiquities and Monuments)

Mr Kenneth Tam
Chief Heritage Manager (Antiquities and Monuments)

Mrs Ada Yau
Curator (Education and Publicity)

Ms Fione Lo
Curator (Historical Buildings)

Mr Kevin Sun
Curator (Archaeology)

Miss Addy Wong
Senior Marketing Coordinator (Heritage and Museums)

Dr Alan Fung
Assistant Curator I (Building Survey)

Miss Amanda Leung
Senior Executive Assistant (Antiquities and Monuments)

Miss Catherine Chiu
Executive Officer I (Antiquities and Monuments) 2

Miss Pauline Poon
Assistant Curator II (Building Survey)

Planning Department

Mr Raymond Lee Kai-wing
Acting Assistant Director/Metro

Architectural Services Department

Mr S L Lam
Senior Maintenance Surveyor/Heritage

Opening Remarks

The Chairman thanked Members and representatives from Government departments for attending the meeting.

**Item 1 Confirmation of Minutes of the Special Meeting held on 27 October 2009
(Board Minutes AAB/S3/2009-10)**

2. The minutes of the Special Meeting held on 27 October 2009 were confirmed without amendment.

**Item 2 Matters Arising and Progress Report
(Board Paper AAB/31/2009-10)**

3. Mr Tom Ming highlighted that education and publicity activities organized by Commissioner for Heritage's Office (CHO) had been included in the Progress Report and would be reported to Members regularly. He then invited Mrs Ada Yau to brief Members on major activities.

4. Mrs Ada Yau reported that the "Faces and Places - Heritage Photo Exhibition" organised jointly by CHO and the Royal Asiatic Society was mounted at the Central Police Station Compound and Heritage Discovery Center (HDC) consecutively from September to November 2009. Besides, the "Heritage Alive: UNESCO Culture Heritage Awards" exhibition organised jointly by UNESCO Bangkok Office, Architectural Conservation Programme (ACP) of Hong Kong University, CHO and Antiquities and Monuments Office (AMO) was being staged at HDC until 17 February 2010.

5. In addition, CHO was organising guided tours at the Tai Tam Waterworks Heritage Trail as well as Kowloon to promote among youth and general public a better understanding of the heritage sites in the area. CHO and AMO were also developing a teaching kit for general studies of the new senior secondary curriculum on heritage conservation, which was expected to be launched before the start of the next school year in September 2010.

6. In response to a Member's inquiry, Dr Louis Ng briefed Members that the Conservation Plan of the redevelopment of the Former Explosives Magazine Site was presented to AAB in 2004 and AMO had been closely monitoring the works. He also suggested that a site visit be arranged for Members to have a better understanding of the project.

7. The Chairman further stressed the importance of communication between AAB and project proponents at an early stage. A Member supplemented that more guidelines on

heritage conservation could be provided to equip project proponents with major conservation principles.

8. Mr Jack Chan replied that CHO was arranging early consultation with AAB on draft Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) reports. He also explained that conservation guidelines were provided for declared monuments and buildings under Revitalisation Scheme. Nevertheless, he would take note of the Member's view on providing general conservation guidelines for graded historic buildings.

9. Members noted the Progress Report.

10. Before moving on to other agenda items, the Chairman took the opportunity to discuss an article covered by media recently. It reported that the dismantled timber planks staircases of "Blue House" were not damaged by termites and thus should not be replaced. Mr Tom Ming clarified that the wooden stairs were infested by termites and had to be replaced for safety reason. However, the dismantled planks would not be disposed but retained for alternative uses after conservation treatment.

11. Mr Kenneth Tam emphasised that the dangerous planks had to be urgently replaced to ensure safety of the residents of "Blue House". He had personally inspected the dismantled planks and confirmed infestation of termites.

12. A Member who had responded to the reporter's inquiry, clarified that he had already told the reporter that the dismantled staircases were structurally unserviceable and thus supported the government's decision. He also stressed that public safety should be of utmost concern.

**Item 3 Assessment of 1, 444 Historic Buildings – Finalisation of the Gradings of Proposed Graded Buildings
(Board Paper AAB/32/2009-10)**

13. Mr Tom Ming highlighted that Members would finalize the proposed grading of historic buildings for which no adverse comments have been received in the priority order of Grade 1, 2, 3 and nil grades (as listed in Annex of the Board Paper).

14. Mr Tom Ming also reported that requests for upgrading historic buildings Number¹ 226 (Dragon Garden, Tsuen Wan) and Number¹ 377 (Hau Mei Fung Ancestral Hall, Sheung Shui) were received recently so they were removed from the list and would be discussed under Step 2.

Note :

1. Number referred to Number on the list announced on 19 March 2009.

15. The Chairman invited Dr. Alan Fung to take Members through each item listed in the Paper one by one, with the aid of Powerpoint briefing. The Chairman explained to Members that they should immediately voice out their comments or requests for site visit, if any, to the respective building.

16. While going through the list of proposed Grade 1 buildings, a Member expressed his interest in visiting Number¹ 9 (Bishop's House, Central).

17. Views and comments expressed by Members on particular buildings were summarized as follows :

- (i) collective memory was one of the important factors when considering its final grading:
 - Number¹ 121 (Hung Lau, Tuen Mun);
- (ii) grading would be confirmed after comparing with similar waterworks structures:
 - Number¹ 221(Shing Mun (Jubilee) Reservoir, Bellmouth Overflow, Tsuen Wan);
 - Number¹ 268 (Shek Lei Pui Reception Reservoir, Dam, Sha Tin);
 - Number¹ 269 (Shek Lei Pui Reception Reservoir, Valve House, Sha Tin);
 - Number¹ 513 (Shing Mun (Jubilee) Reservoir, Bellmouth Overflow, Sha Tin);
 - Number¹ 514 (Shing Mun (Jubilee) Reservoir, Gate Shaft, Sha Tin);
 - Number¹ 569 (Shing Mun (Jubilee) Reservoir, Weir, Sha Tin);
- (iii) grading of buildings in San Lau Street would be considered in one batch:
 - Number¹ 250 (No. 5 San Lau Street, Sha Tau Kok);
 - Number¹ 263 (No. 18 San Lau Street, Sha Tau Kok);
 - Number¹ 265 (No. 20 San Lau Street, Sha Tau Kok);
 - Number¹ 294 (No. 2 San Lau Street, Sha Tau Kok);
- (iv) buildings suggested to be upgraded because of their historic value:
 - Number¹ 223 (No. Chou Wong Yi Kung Study Hall, Yuen Long);
 - Number¹ 358 (Race Course Fire Memorial, Happy Valley);
 - Number¹ 373 (Old Ping Shan Police Station, Yuen Long);
 - Number¹ 507 (Mei Ho House, Block 41, Shek Kip Mei);
- (v) building suggested to be upgraded because of its group value:
 - Number¹ 492 (No 24, Lee Yick Street, Yuen Long);
- (vi) grading would be discussed after comparing with similar item:
 - Number¹ 352 (Bungalow, West Point Filters, Mid-levels);
 - Number¹ 576 (Hindu Temple, No. 1B, Happy Valley) ;

Note :

¹ Number referred to Number on the list announced on 19 March 2009.

- (vii) building suggested to be divided for re-assessment:
 - Number¹ 408 (St. Paul's Co-educational College, Central).

18. Members raised the following issues relating to the grading mechanism and agreed to discuss them after the 1,444 exercise:

- (i) appropriateness to accord a grading to declared monuments;
- (ii) mechanism for reviewing the finalized grading of 1,444 historic buildings;
- (iii) guidelines to deal with requests for grading assessment of new historic buildings / structures;
- (iv) feasibility to outline the boundary of graded buildings for public information.

19. A Member was concerned on how to determine the impact of alterations or additions to a building on the grading. Mr Tom Ming explained that it depended on their effect upon the building's historic significance or architectural integrity.

20. In response to a Member's inquiry on the guidelines to divide or combine buildings within a compound for assessment, Mr Tom Ming suggested that it was preferable to assess buildings as a whole if they formed a harmonious integral building cluster. On the other hand, buildings could be assessed individually if they were built in distinct periods.

21. The Chairman concluded that all proposed Grade 1 and 2 buildings listed in the Annex of the Paper were discussed. Discussion of the remaining items would continue in coming meetings.

Item 4 Any Other Business

22. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

Note :

¹ Number referred to Number on the list announced on 19 March 2009.

Antiquities and Monuments Office
Leisure and Cultural Services Department
March 2010

Ref: LCS AM 22/3