

**ANTIQUITIES ADVISORY BOARD**

**Minutes of the 142<sup>nd</sup> Meeting  
held on Friday, 22 January 2010 at 9:30 a.m.  
in Conference Room, Hong Kong Heritage Discovery Centre  
Kowloon Park, Haiphong Road, Tsim Sha Tsui, Kowloon**

- Present: Mr Bernard Charnwut Chan, GBS, JP (Chairman)  
Dr Anissa Chan Wong Lai-kuen, MH, JP  
Ms Susanna Chiu Lai-kuen  
Mr Andrew Lam Siu-lo, JP  
Professor Lau Chi-pang  
Ms Lilian Law Suk-kwan  
Dr Lee Ho-yin  
Mr Laurence Li Lu-jen  
Dr Ng Cho-nam, BBS, JP  
Mr Ng Yat-cheung, JP  
Mr Almon Poon Chin-hung, JP  
Professor Simon Shen Xu-hui  
Professor Billy So Kee-long  
Dr Linda Tsui Yee-wan  
Ir Dr Greg Wong Chak-yan, JP  
Mr Bryan Wong Kim-yeung  
Ms Heaster Cheung (Secretary)  
Chief Administration Manager  
(Antiquities and Monuments)  
Leisure and Cultural Services Department
- Absent with Apologies: Mrs Mariana Cheng Cho Chi-on, BBS, JP  
Mr Patrick Fung Pak-tung, SC  
Mr Philip Kan Siu-lun  
Mr Kwong Hoi-ying  
Professor Bernard Lim Wan-fung, JP  
Dr Tracey Lu Lie-dan  
Mr Yeung Yiu-chung, BBS, JP
- In Attendance: Development Bureau  
  
Mrs Jessie Ting, JP  
Deputy Secretary (Works)<sup>1</sup>

Mr Jack Chan  
Commissioner for Heritage

Mrs Susanne Wong Ho Wing-sze  
AS(Heritage Conservation)4

Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Dr Louis Ng  
Assistant Director (Heritage and Museums)

Mr Tom Ming  
Executive Secretary (Antiquities and Monuments)

Mr Kenneth Tam  
Chief Heritage Manager (Antiquities and Monuments)

Mrs Ada Yau  
Curator (Education and Publicity)

Ms Fione Lo  
Curator (Historical Buildings)

Mr Kevin Sun  
Curator (Archaeology)

Ms Wendy Tsang  
Principal Marketing Coordinator (Heritage and Museums)

Miss Addy Wong  
Senior Marketing Coordinator (Heritage and Museums)

Dr Alan Fung  
Assistant Curator I (Building Survey)

Miss Amanda Leung  
Senior Executive Assistant (Antiquities and Monuments)

Miss Catherine Chiu  
Executive Officer I (Antiquities and Monuments) 2

Planning Department

Mrs. Alice Mak Wong Kit-fong  
Senior Town Planner/Metro & Urban Renewal

Architectural Services Department

Mr Fong Siu-wai  
Assistant Director (Property Services)

Mr S L Lam  
Senior Maintenance Surveyor/Heritage

**Opening Remarks**

The Chairman thanked Members and representatives from Government departments for attending the meeting.

**Item 1      Matters Arising**

2.            As referring to Members' queries on the proposed grading of certain historic buildings raised at the 141<sup>st</sup> AAB meeting on 18 December 2009, Mr. Tom Ming reported that additional information on eight buildings on Lee Yick Street and four buildings on Cheung Shing Street had been received from a Member to facilitate the reconsideration of gradings. Members were welcomed to submit additional comments/ information to the AAB Secretariat, if any.

**Item 2      Assessment of 1, 444 Historic Buildings – Finalisation of the Gradings of  
Proposed Graded Buildings  
(Board Paper AAB/32/2009-10- Continued)  
(Board Paper AAB/35/2009-10)**

3.            The Chairman recapped that the final gradings of 252 historic buildings were endorsed at the 141<sup>st</sup> AAB meeting held on 18 December 2009.

4.            Mr Tom Ming updated that a query on the grading of Number<sup>1</sup> 697 (No. 4 Li Kwan Avenue, Tai Hang, Wan Chai) and requests for upgrading another four historic buildings [i.e., Number<sup>1</sup> 728 (Yeung Ancestral Hall, Yuen Long), Number<sup>1</sup> 845 (Lai Chi Kok Hospital, Lai Chi Kok), Number<sup>1</sup> 896 (Tsang Ancestral Hall, Chuen Lung, Tsuen Wan) and Number<sup>1</sup> 992 (Old Far East Flying Training School, Kowloon City)] were received recently. They were removed from the list and would be discussed under Step 2.

Note :

1. Number referred to Number on the list announced on 19 March 2009.

5. The Chairman then invited Dr. Alan Fung to take Members through the list of proposed Grade 3 buildings starting from Number<sup>1</sup>. 580 attached to Paper AAB/32/2009-10 one by one, with the aid of Powerpoint. Views and comments expressed by Members on particular buildings were summarized as follows :

- (i) Grading of buildings would be considered after AMO's further review if any structures were illegally erected therein:
  - Number<sup>1</sup> 628 (No. 51 San Wai Tsuen, San Tin, Yuen Long)
  - Number<sup>1</sup> 658 (No. 35 San Wai Tsuen, San Tin, Yuen Long )
  - Number<sup>1</sup> 659 (No. 36 San Wai Tsuen, San Tin, Yuen Long)
  - Number<sup>1</sup> 784 (Toi Yuen, No. 71 San Wai Tsuen, San Tin, Yuen Long)
  - Number<sup>1</sup> 994 (No. 119 Tai Kei Leng Tsuen, Shap Pat Heung, Yuen Long)

Mr Jack Chan opined and the Chairman concurred that consideration of the finalized gradings be based on the historic value and architectural merit of historic buildings.
- (ii) Grading suggested to be re-assessed in view of its historic value, social status and rarity:
  - Number<sup>1</sup> 822 (Entrance Gate of Wing Ning Wai, Lung Yeuk Tau, Fanling)
- (iii) Grading suggested to be re-assessed in view of its significance to Hong Kong development:
  - Number<sup>1</sup> 886 (Peak Tramways Co. Ltd., No. 1 Lugard Road, The Peak)
- (iv) Grading would be confirmed after obtaining more information on its proposed downgrading from existing Grade 1 to proposed Grade 3:
  - Number<sup>1</sup> 974 (Tin Hau Temple, Sai O, Kat O)

6. The following members declared interest during the discussion as follows:

- (i) the owner of Number<sup>1</sup> 605 & 606 (No. 118 & 120 Blue Pool Road, Happy Valley) is a relative of the Chairman;
- (ii) the owner of Number<sup>1</sup> 744 (Nos. 4 & 7A, and Lot WCL 132 in DD123, Sai Tau Wai, Wang Chau, Yuen Long) is a friend of Mr Ng Yat-cheung; and
- (iii) as members of Urban Renewal Authority and Town Planning Board respectively, Mr Almon Poon Chin-hung and Dr Ng Cho-nam declared that they had participated in the discussions related to Number<sup>1</sup> 1036 & 1078 (No. 9 & 10 Yu Lok Lane, H.K).

7. Members noted and endorsed that some historic buildings were downgraded as a result of renovation/ reconstruction causing substantial change to the buildings.

Note :

<sup>1</sup> Number referred to Number on the list announced on 19 March 2009.

8. Members raised the following issues relating to the grading mechanism and agreed to discuss them at a later stage:

- (i) AAB's involvement in preventing deterioration of historic buildings; and.
- (ii) creation of a new category "transport facilities" for grading assessment.

9. While noting that the Expert Panel would follow the six assessment criteria, some Members were concerned that other relevant factors might not have been taken into account or properly reflected in the grading of certain historic buildings. After deliberation, the Chairman advised that the Board should act in a prudent manner by making reference to the proposed gradings recommended by the Expert Panel in finalizing the gradings to the 1,444 historic buildings.

10. Dr Louis Ng supplemented that a two-tier assessment approach was adopted by the Expert Panel. All the buildings were first assessed against the six criteria at Stage 1. The results were reviewed by the Panel at Stage 2 based on three parameters: historical, typological and contextual.

11. In response to a Member's inquiry on the Financial Assistance for Maintenance Scheme (FAMS), Mr Jack Chan explained that an application under the FAMS had to be lodged by building owner(s). DEVB would flexibly deal with application(s) of complicated ownership.

12. The Chairman concluded that all proposed Grade 3 buildings listed in the Annex to the Paper AAB/32/2009-10 were discussed. The Board would continue to deliberate AAB Paper AAB/32/2009-10 and AAB/35/2009-10 in the next meeting.

### **Item 3      Any Other Business**

13. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 12:05 p.m.

Note :

<sup>1</sup> Number referred to Number on the list announced on 19 March 2009.

**Antiquities and Monuments Office**  
**Leisure and Cultural Services Department**  
**March 2010**

---

**Ref: LCS AM 22/3**