

ANTIQUITIES ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of the 143rd Meeting
held on Thursday, 4 February 2010 at 3:00 p.m.
in Conference Room, Hong Kong Heritage Discovery Centre
Kowloon Park, Haiphong Road, Tsim Sha Tsui, Kowloon

- Present: Mr Bernard Charnwut Chan, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Mrs Mariana Cheng Cho Chi-on, BBS, JP
Ms Susanna Chiu Lai-kuen
Mr Philip Kan Siu-lun
Mr Kwong Hoi-ying
Professor Lau Chi-pang
Ms Lilian Law Suk-kwan
Dr Lee Ho-yin
Mr Laurence Li Lu-jen
Dr Tracey Lu Lie-dan
Dr Ng Cho-nam, BBS, JP
Mr Ng Yat-cheung, JP
Mr Almon Poon Chin-hung, JP
Professor Simon Shen Xu-hui
Professor Billy So Kee-long
Dr Linda Tsui Yee-wan
Ir Dr Greg Wong Chak-yan, JP
Ms Heaster Cheung (Secretary)
Chief Administration Manager (Antiquities and
Monuments)
Leisure and Cultural Services Department
- Absent with Apologies: Dr Anissa Chan Wong Lai-kuen, MH, JP
Mr Patrick Fung Pak-tung, SC
Mr Andrew Lam Siu-lo, JP
Professor Bernard Lim Wan-fung, JP
Mr Bryan Wong Kim-yeung
Mr Yeung Yiu-chung, BBS, JP

In Attendance: Development Bureau

Mr Jack Chan
Commissioner for Heritage

Mrs Susanne Wong Ho Wing-sze
AS(Heritage Conservation)4

Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Dr Louis Ng
Assistant Director (Heritage and Museums)

Mr Tom Ming
Executive Secretary (Antiquities and Monuments)

Mr Kenneth Tam
Chief Heritage Manager (Antiquities and Monuments)

Mrs Ada Yau
Curator (Education and Publicity)

Ms Fione Lo
Curator (Historical Buildings)

Mr Kevin Sun
Curator (Archaeology)

Miss Addy Wong
Senior Marketing Coordinator (Heritage and Museums)

Dr Alan Fung
Assistant Curator I (Building Survey)

Miss Amanda Leung
Senior Executive Assistant (Antiquities and Monuments)

Miss Catherine Chiu
Executive Officer I (Antiquities and Monuments) 2

Planning Department

Mr Ling Kar-kan
Assistant Director/Metro

Architectural Services Department

Mr Fong Siu-wai
Assistant Director (Property Services)

Mr S L Lam
Senior Maintenance Surveyor/Heritage

Opening Remarks

The Chairman thanked Members and representatives from Government departments for attending the meeting.

Item 1 Matters Arising

2. Mr Tom Ming reported that additional information on historic buildings Number¹ 223 (Chou Wong Yi Kung Study Hall, Yuen Long), Number¹ 358 (Race Course Fire Memorial, Happy Valley), Number¹ 373 (Old Ping Shan Police Station, Yuen Long) and Number¹ 507 (Mei Ho House, Shek Kip Mei) had just been received from a Member and was tabled to facilitate reconsideration of their gradings in the coming meetings.

Item 2 Assessment of 1, 444 Historic Buildings – Finalisation of the Gradings of Proposed Graded Buildings (Board Paper AAB/32/2009-10 continued and Board Paper AAB/35/2009-10)

3. In reply to a Member's inquiries raised in last meeting regarding four buildings in San Wai Tsuen (Number¹ 628, Number¹ 658, Number¹ 659, Number¹ 784) and one building in Tai Kei Leng Tsuen (Number¹ 994), Mr Tom Ming informed the meeting that there was no record in the Lands Department to show that the front and rear parts of these buildings were later-day additions. In this regard, Members endorsed the final gradings of these buildings.

4. Mr Tom Ming also remarked that requests for upgrading historic buildings Number¹ 1329 (No. 22 Lee Yick Street, Yuen Long) and Number¹ 1341 (No. 44 Cheung Shing Street, Yuen Long) were received from a Member so they were removed from the list and would be discussed under Step 2.

5. The Meeting went on to continue the discussion of the list of proposed nil grade buildings starting from Number¹ 1155 attached to Paper AAB/32/2009-10. The Chairman suggested and Members agreed unanimously the endorsement of buildings with no change in their original and proposed gradings.

6. The Chairman then invited Dr Alan Fung to take Members through those buildings which were proposed to be downgraded one by one, with the aid of Powerpoint. Members endorsed that some buildings were downgraded owing to the substantial changes to the heritage value of the buildings resulted from renovation or alteration works. After deliberation, Members agreed to consider the gradings of the following buildings separately because of the reasons as specified:

- (i) grading would be considered after comparison with similar waterworks structures:
 - Number¹ 1206 (Ruins of a Senior Staff Bungalow of Tai Tam Bywash Reservoir, Tai Tam);
- (ii) building suggested to be upgraded in view of their authenticity kept:
 - Number¹ 1358 (Kwun Yam Temple, Tai Po).

7. In response to a Member's question, Mr Tom Ming explained that buildings within the compound of Number¹ 1192 (Ching Chung Koon, Tuen Mun) were assessed as a whole in the past, whereas these buildings were assessed based on their individual heritage value under the current exercise, thus causing changes to the grading of certain buildings.

Note :

1. Number referred to Number on the list announced on 19 March 2009.

8. After finishing the discussion of Paper AAB/32/2009-10, the Chairman invited Dr Alan Fung to go through each item listed in Annex A and Annex B to Paper AAB/35/2009-10 one by one, with the aid of Powerpoint. Members agreed to reconsider the grading of the following buildings separately because of the reasons as specified:

- (i) building suggested to be upgraded in view of their authenticity kept:
 - Number¹ 940 (Man Ming Temple, Sheung Shui);
- (ii) grading would be considered after comparison with similar items:
 - Number¹ 527 (Tin Hau Temple, Tai Po);
 - Number¹ 969 (Hip Tin Temple (Kwan Tai Temple), Tai Po);
 - Number¹ 551 (No. 6 Kennedy Road, Central);
 - Number¹ 552 (No. 8 Kennedy Road, Central);
- (iii) grading would be considered after obtaining more information on the proposed downgrading :
 - Number¹ 381 (Yuen Kwan Tai Temple, Yuen Long);
 - Number¹ 1053 (Tam Kung Temple, Shau Kei Wan);

9. A Member suggested that site visits to see temples with substantial alteration/renovation be arranged. The Chairman further proposed that, for some cases, the Board could meet with owners or relevant parties such as District Councils, Chinese Temples Committee (CTC) to explain the Board's decision.

10. Some Members expressed concern that owners of privately-owned buildings would carry out alternation / renovation works on their own, without knowing such works would affect the heritage value of the buildings. Mr Tom Ming responded that :

- (i) whenever a owner lodged an application for demolition and /or redevelopment to Buildings Department, Lands Department and Planning Department, Antiquities and Monuments Office (AMO) and Commissioner for Heritage's Office (CHO) would be alerted immediately; in case the Buildings Department issued any repair order involving demolition or removal of the original parts of a graded building, it would also inform CHO and AMO.
- (ii) owners had been informed of the Financial Assistance for Maintenance Scheme which could provide subsidy up to \$1 million for each repair/ maintenance project of a privately-owned graded building ;
- (iii) AMO would work closely with relevant parties such as CTC to provide technical advice where and when necessary.

11. A Member suggested that Number¹ 197 (No. 39 Long Chok Tsuen, Yuen Long) be considered for declaration as a monument in 2011 to tie in with the 100th anniversary of the Revolution 1911 because the building played an important role in the history of revolutionary movement under the leadership of Dr Sun Yat-sen. He also remarked that maintenance for that building was necessary. Another Member supplemented that the building, built in the form of a *diaolou*, had high architectural merit in Hong Kong. Mr Jack Chan responded that follow-up actions would be arranged.

Note :

¹ Number referred to Number on the list announced on 19 March 2009.

12. Grading of some buildings were endorsed after discussion, particular views expressed by Members were summarized as follows :

- (i) grading of Number¹ 60 (Hau Wong Temple, Kowloon City) was endorsed because of its historic significance;
- (ii) grading of Number¹ 774 (Luk Wu Ching Ser, Main Building, Lantau Island) and Number¹ 821 (Luk Wu Ching Ser, Shun Yeung Sin Yuen, Lantau Island) were endorsed in consideration of the collections of movable artefacts within the buildings.

13. The grading of Number¹ 933 (Tin Hau Temple, Wong Lung Hang, Tung Chung, Lantau Island) was deliberated in detail and Members agreed to accord the building a Grade 2 status after taking into account the factors as listed below :

- (i) authenticity still kept despite the relocation from Chek Lap Kok to Tung Chung;
- (ii) social value to local community;
- (iii) heritage value as one of relics of Chek Lap Lok;
- (iv) association with the development of Hong Kong in the 1990s.

14. The Chairman concluded that all buildings listed in Annex A and the first 14 item listed in Annex B to Paper AAB/35/2009-10, were discussed. The Board would continue to deliberate the remaining items listed in Annex B to Paper AAB/35/2009-10 in the next meeting.

Item 3 Any Other Business

15. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:05 p.m.

Note:

¹ Number referred to Number on the list announced on 19 March 2009.

Antiquities and Monuments Office
Leisure and Cultural Services Department
April 2010

Ref: LCS AM 22/3