

ANTIQUITIES ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of the 146th Meeting
held on Monday, 17 May 2010 at 3:30 p.m.
in Conference Room, Hong Kong Heritage Discovery Centre
Kowloon Park, Haiphong Road, Tsim Sha Tsui, Kowloon

- Present: Mr Bernard Charnwut Chan, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Dr Anissa Chan Wong Lai-kuen, MH, JP
Ms Susanna Chiu Lai-kuen
Mr Philip Kan Siu-lun
Professor Lau Chi-pang
Ms Lilian Law Suk-kwan
Dr Lee Ho-yin
Professor Bernard Lim Wan-fung, JP
Dr Tracey Lu Lie-dan
Dr Ng Cho-nam, BBS, JP
Mr Ng Yat-cheung, JP
Mr Almon Poon Chin-hung, JP
Professor Billy So Kee-long
Dr Linda Tsui Yee-wan
Mr Yeung Yiu-chung, BBS, JP
Ms Heaster Cheung (Secretary)
Chief Administration Manager (Antiquities and
Monuments)
Leisure and Cultural Services Department
- Absent with Apologies: Mrs Mariana Cheng Cho Chi-on, BBS, JP
Mr Patrick Fung Pak-tung, SC
Mr Kwong Hoi-ying
Mr Andrew Lam Siu-lo, JP
Mr Laurence Li Lu-jen
Professor Simon Shen Xu-hui
Ir Dr Greg Wong Chak-yan, JP
Mr Bryan Wong Kim-yeung

- In Attendance: Development Bureau

Mr Jack Chan
Commissioner for Heritage

Mr Ku Kwok-pun
Engineer (Heritage Conservation) 3

Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Dr Louis Ng
Assistant Director (Heritage and Museums)

Mr Tom Ming
Executive Secretary (Antiquities and Monuments)

Mr Kenneth Tam
Chief Heritage Manager (Antiquities and Monuments)

Mrs Ada Yau
Curator (Education and Publicity)

Ms Fione Lo
Curator (Historical Buildings)

Mr Kevin Sun
Curator (Archaeology)

Ms Wendy Tsang
Principal Marketing Coordinator

Miss Addy Wong
Senior Marketing Coordinator (Heritage and Museums)

Dr Alan Fung
Assistant Curator I (Building Survey)

Miss Amanda Leung
Senior Executive Assistant (Antiquities and Monuments)

Miss Catherine Chiu
Executive Officer I (Antiquities and Monuments) 2

Planning Department

Ms Brenda Au
Acting Assistant Director/Metro

Architectural Services Department

Mr Kevin Li
Senior Architect/Heritage

Opening Remarks

The Chairman thanked Members and representatives from Government departments for attending the meeting.

Item 1 Matters Arising and Progress Report (Board Paper AAB/41/2009-10)

2. Mr Tom Ming briefed Members on the preparatory actions taken in connection with the proposal to declare of Tang Kwong U Ancestral Hall and Kom Tong Hall as monuments and details would be submitted to the Board at the next meeting for reaffirmation of their declaration recommendation given in 1994 and 2004 respectively.
3. In response to a Member's inquiry, Mr Tom Ming reported that repair work of the Former Explosives Magazine site was in progress and has been substantially completed. AMO has been working closely with the project proponent in refining the conservation works. He added that a site visit would be arranged for Members to have a better understanding of the project. Mr Kenneth Tam supplemented that the renovation work was expected to be completed by end of 2010.
4. In view of the prolonged delay of the project, the Member asked AMO to assist in expediting the works. Mr Tom Ming responded that AMO would closely monitor the progress of the conservation of the historic buildings. Members noted that Lands Department would also keep monitoring the site in accordance with the terms and conditions of the Private Treaty Grant in respect of the site.
5. Dr Lee Ho-yin declared interest as he and his counterparts from the University of Hong Kong had participated in various parts of the Former Explosives Magazine project.
6. The Chairman suggested that updates of major issues/events be disseminated to Members by email to enhance communication. Mr Jack Chan agreed with the Chairman and reassured the Board's significant role in heritage conservation.

Item 2 Assessment of 1, 444 Historic Buildings – Finalisation of the Gradings of Proposed Graded Buildings (Board Paper AAB/40/2009-10)

7. The Chairman invited Dr Alan Fung to take Members through the items listed in Annex A to Paper AAB/40/2009-10, with the aid of Powerpoint.
8. The grading of Number¹ 861 (Leather Factory, Peng Chau) was endorsed after considering the factors summarised as below :
 - (i) historic value of leather factory as one of three important industries at Peng Chau;

¹ The numbering of the historic buildings mentioned in the minutes follows that adopted for the 1444 territory-wide historic buildings listed in the AAB Board Paper AAB/8/2009-10 on the proposed gradings of all these historic buildings.

- (ii) social value to local community;
- (iii) group value with ruins of the Match Factory as well as the Office and Mess of Sing Lei Hap Gei Lime Factory (the other two important industries at Peng Chau).

9. Dr Louis Ng remarked there was increasing aspiration in the community to protect the remains of industries to illustrate a place's economic development. In the Mainland, some of these industries buildings had been transformed into creative industries landmarks. The Chairman requested the Commissioner for Heritage's Office to look into the potential for preservation and revitalisation of such buildings in Hong Kong.

10. Furthermore, some Members shared the view that plaques with brief information should be installed outside graded buildings to facilitate public's understanding of their heritage value. In reply to this, Mr Jack Chan pointed out that CHO was planning a series of education and publicity projects after the 1,444 exercise, namely :

- (i) installation of plaques for graded buildings subject to owners' consent;
- (ii) recognition to owners for their efforts in preservation of their historic buildings.

11. A Member inquired about the impact of maintenance works of Number 418 (Earth God Shrine of Kam Tin, Sheung Shui) on the nearby old tree. Mr Tom Ming explained that the maintenance works to be financed under the Financial Assistance for Maintenance Scheme of DEVB was for upkeep of the Shrine and would not affect the old tree. Mr Jack Chan supplemented that he would seek advice from the Greening, Landscape and Tree Management Section of DEVB), if necessary.

12. Members suggested that Number 762 (Fat Tat Tong, Sha Tau Kok) be upgraded in view of its rarity and social value. Its grading would be reconsidered after re-assessment by the Expert Panel.

13. Members noted Number 1044 (Hung Shing Temple, Hung Leng) had undergone extensive alterations thus diminishing the heritage value. They agreed that the building should be downgraded.

14. A Member questioned about the tender exercise in respect of Number 1015 (Central Ordinance Munitions Depot, Shouson Hill) which was currently used as a wine club. Mr Jack Chan responded that tenderers were required to submit technical and price information in separate envelopes. The weighting for technical score which included conservation of the building was 60%, whereas weighting for price score was 40%. Under the two-envelope approach, technical assessment would be conducted first and only those tenderers whose scores in the technical assessment were above the passing score would be considered for price assessment. He remarked that the system would ensure a fair, open and just tender exercise with due consideration of heritage conservation.

(Discussion of agenda item 2 was temporarily adjourned for the discussion of agenda item 3 and was resumed after that.)

15. Mr Almon Poon declared interest when discussing the buildings at Tsing Shan Monastery, Castle Peak (Number 88, Number 160, Number 200, Number 441, Number 529, Number 533, Number 538). Mr Tom Ming pointed out that buildings within the compound of Tsing Shan Monastery had been assessed as one single entity in the past but these buildings were now assessed individually based on each building's heritage value, thereby resulting in changes to the grading of certain buildings.

16. While expressing his support to the proposed grading of Number 35 (Lin Fa Temple, Wan Chai), a Member suggested AMO to advise the owner to restore the wall of the front hall to its original design.

17. The Chairman worried that Number 695 (No. 11 Yuk Sau Street, Happy Valley) was possibly at the risk of redevelopment and suggested CHO/AMO to keep a close eye on it and communicate with the owner as necessary.

18. In reply to a Member's question regarding Number 147 (Tat Tak communal Hall, Yuen Long), Mr Tom Ming remarked that a feasibility study of in-situ preservation had been completed and restoration works would commence soon.

19. A Member stated that the forecourt of Number 380 (Yu Yuen, Yuen Long) had undergone substantial changes. Members endorsed the proposed Grade 2 status of the building.

20. After discussion, Members endorsed the grading of 55 buildings listed in Annex A to Paper AAB/40/2009-10. The results would be uploaded to the AMO's website accordingly. The Board will continue to deliberate the items listed in Annex B and Annex C at the next meeting.

**Item 3 Kai Tak Development Public Engagement Programme on Preservation of Lung Tsun Stone Bridge Remnants
(Board Paper AAB/42/2009-10)**

21. The Chairman introduced the presentation team :

Presenter

- (i) Mr Stephen Tang
Head of Kai Tak Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD);
- (ii) Mrs Sorais Lee
Chief Engineer / Kowloon 1, CEDD;

In attendance

- (iii) Mr Kevin Sun
Curator(Archaeology), AMO;
- (iv) Ms Jessica Chu
Senior Town Planner / Kowloon 3, Planning Department;
- (v) Mr Peter Chui
Senior Engineer / 6 (Kowloon), CEDD;

- (vi) Mr Igor Ho
Technical Director, AECOM Asia Co Ltd.

22. Mr Stephen Tang and Mrs Sorais Lee gave Members a powerpoint presentation on the background of the Lung Tsun Stone Bridge (the Bridge) and the public engagement programme on the preservation of the Bridge remnants. Mrs Sorais Lee highlighted that the extant sections of the Bridge and the “Pavilion for Greeting Officials” (the Pavilion) were classified as highly significant. She also briefed Members on the 2-stage public engagement programme and the three principles for preservation of the Bridge.

23. Views and comments expressed by Members were summarized as follows :
- (i) participation of experts with heritage conservation experiences would be beneficial;
 - (ii) restrictions on building height and density in the vicinity should be imposed;
 - (iii) the Bridge, the Pavilion and Kowloon Walled City Park could be linked up and developed as a local open space with greenery;
 - (iv) development of the site could complement with the development Kai Tak Cruise Terminal;
 - (v) a mock bridge could be constructed along the Bridge remnants to facilitate public viewing and a virtual Pavilion could also be built at its original location;
 - (vi) arrangements should be made to introduce the history related to the Bridge;
 - (vii) pragmatic balance between heritage conservation and economic development should be struck;
 - (viii) display of remnants with glass cover was not supported because glass would be easily misted up.

24. In response to the Chairman’s inquiry, Mr Stephen Tang said that details of the public engagement would be announced in early June 2010. The Chairman proposed that more workshops should be arranged to enhance public understanding of the history and the archaeological investigation of the Bridge.

25. Mr Jack Chan took the opportunity to introduce the teaching kit on heritage conservation for liberal studies of the new senior secondary curriculum, which was expected to be launched in August 2010. In addition to an introduction to Hong Kong’s heritage conservation policy, the kit would also highlight important heritage sites / buildings including the Bridge.

26. Mr Stephan Tang thanked Members for their valuable views and suggestions and the presentation team left at this juncture.

Item 4 Any Other Business

27. Ms Heaster Cheung reported that a report (in the form of CD-ROM) on the two-day study visit to Guangzhou on 11 and 12 January 2010 by the AAB and Advisory Committee on Revitalisation of Historic Buildings had been prepared and was tabled for

Members' perusal. The CD-ROM would be sent by post to other Members who were not able to attend the Meeting.

28. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:05 p.m.

Antiquities and Monuments Office
Leisure and Cultural Services Department
August 2010

Ref: LCS AM 22/3