

ANTIQUITIES ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of the 168th Meeting
on Tuesday, 16 September 2014 at 3:10 p.m.
in Conference Room, Hong Kong Heritage Discovery Centre
Kowloon Park, Haiphong Road, Tsim Sha Tsui, Kowloon

Present: Mr Andrew Lam Siu-lo, JP (Chairman)
Mr Stephen Chan Chit-kwai, BBS, JP
Prof Chung Po-yin
Prof Ho Puay-peng, JP
Prof Ho Pui-yin
Ms Lilian Law Suk-kwan, JP
Mr Philip Liao Yi-kang
Mr Kenny Lin Ching-pui
Ms Janet Pau Heng-ting
Prof Billy So Kee-long
Dr Winnie Tang Shuk-ming, JP
Ms Ava Tse Suk-ying, SBS
Sr Wong Bay
Mr Conrad Wong Tin-cheung, BBS, JP

Mr Asa Lee (Secretary)
Senior Executive Officer (Antiquities and Monuments)
Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Absent with Apologies:

Mr Chan Ka-kui, BBS, JP
Prof Rebecca Chiu Lai-har, JP
Mr Tim Ko Tim-keung
Mr Tony Lam Chung-wai
Prof Tracey Lu Lie-dan
Mr Joseph Luc Ngai
Ms Yvonne Shing Mo-han, JP

Ms Karen Tang Shuk-tak

Dr Joseph Ting Sun-pao

In Attendance:

Development Bureau

Miss Vivian Ko

Commissioner for Heritage

Mr Ricky Wong

Chief Assistant Secretary (Works) 2

Mr Ben Lo

Assistant Secretary (Heritage Conservation) 2

Miss Leonie Lee

Assistant Secretary (Heritage Conservation) 3

Mr Eddie Wong

Chief Executive Officer (Heritage Conservation) 1

Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Ms Michelle Li

Director of Leisure and Cultural Services

Ms Cynthia Liu

Deputy Director (Culture)

Dr Louis Ng

Assistant Director (Heritage and Museums)

Mr Tom Ming

Executive Secretary (Antiquities and Monuments)

Ms Lily Chen

Chief Information Officer

Ms Veta Wong
Principal Information Officer (Cultural Services)

Mrs Ada Yau
Curator (Archaeology)
(for item 2 only)

Dr Alan Fung
Assistant Curator I (Buildings Survey)
(for item 4 only)

Planning Department

Mr Eric Yue
Assistant Director /Metro

Architectural Services Department

Mr Fong Siu-wai
Assistant Director (Property Services)

Mr Lam Sair-ling
Senior Maintenance Surveyor/ Heritage

Report of Progress on Archaeological Work at To Kwa Wan Station for Shatin to Central Link – Tai Wai to Hung Hom Section

The Chairman invited the archaeological team responsible for the archaeological excavation works at the works site of the To Kwa Wan Station of the Shatin to Central Link, i.e. Dr Liu Wensuo, Ms Peggy Wong and Mr Raymond Ng, to brief Members on the latest progress of the project.

2. Dr Liu Wensuo provided an update of the excavation in the second and third archaeological works areas, in particular the findings as follows:

- (i) a modern round-shaped well constructed with grooved red bricks, Well J2 as well as remnants of buildings in the 7 test pits (TP11, TP12, TP14, TP15, TP17, TP18 and TP20) and other discoveries of the 6 test pits (TP13, TP16, TP19, TP21, TP22 and TP 23) in Zone A;

- (ii) the stone foundations and compact surfaces of building structures of Song-Yuan period in Zone B;
- (iii) the discoveries dated to Song-Yuan period of the 8 test pits (CT1, CT1a, CT1b, CT2 – CT6) in Zone C; and
- (iv) the Song-Yuan layer with cultural remains in association with those found in the Ventilation Shaft and Adit C and a well of late Qing dynasty to Republic of China period in Zone D.

(Prof Billy So joined the meeting at 3:33 p.m., quorum of the meeting was met after this juncture.)

3. In response to Prof Ho Puay-peng's questions, Dr Liu Wensuo advised that a delineation of the former Sacred Hill on the eastern side would be provided in future, in addition to that on the western side already shown on the location map. He further explained the structure of Pit H27 and Well J2, adding that while some pottery shreds were found near Pit H27, nothing else was found at the bottom of the pit other than a wooden structure. Dr Liu Wensuo further pointed out that a comprehensive picture of the findings in test pits TP11, TP14 and TP17 would only be available after completion of the excavation works in the adjacent areas. Besides, a pit with large amount of pottery shreds was unearthed in TP18 and TP20, which was between the footprint of the Sacred Hill and former seashore areas.

4. Mr Raymond Ng supplemented that the excavation works in test pits TP11, TP12, TP14, TP15, TP18, TP20 of Zone A 6b was in progress and further studies were required for an assessment of the correlation between the archaeological findings in these test pits with those found in the area around Well J5. The findings in Zone B and Zone C were dated to a similar era. In general, the findings in the western side were dated comparatively earlier than those in the eastern side. Dr Liu Wensuo further explained the findings in CT5 and CT6 of Zone C.

5. In response to Prof Billy So's question, Mr Raymond Ng explained that the large amount of pottery shreds unearthed in TP18 and TP20 had broken edges, cracks and scratches which were caused by daily use, indicating that the purpose of the pit was for the disposal of domestic waste.

6. Regarding Dr Winnie Tang's enquiry on the anticipated completion

date of the excavation works and the timing of the availability of an overall picture of the findings for Members' further advice on the preservation plan, Mr Tom Ming explained that while the fieldwork was expected to be completed by the end of September 2014, further studies on the archaeological findings would be conducted afterwards. The Chairman clarified that only the excavation at the works sites related to the construction work of the Mass Transit Railway Corporation Limited (MTRCL) would be completed by the end of September 2014 whereas excavation in other areas would be arranged at a later stage. Mr Raymond Ng pointed out that the excavation works concerned would be completed according to this schedule, subject to weather condition and whether there would be new and complicated archaeological findings to be unearthed.

7. Mr Tom Ming pointed out that in light of Members' suggestion, excavation works were conducted at the fringes outside MTRCL's works site where apparent extension of the unearthed discoveries was identified. In this regard, follow-up excavation works was newly conducted in the area between Zones B and C, which was named as Zone D.

8. The Chairman reiterated that only the excavation at the works sites under MTRCL and at some surrounding areas was targeted to be completed by the end of September 2014. The archaeological team still needed to spend some time to complete the whole assessment of the findings. He further echoed the view of Dr Winnie Tang that the utmost concern of the public and Members was the preservation of the unearthed discoveries. He considered that AAB might formulate its stance on the preservation of the unearthed discoveries after the fieldwork was completed, while the preservation plan itself might involve different assessments and considerations of surrounding land use.

9. Prof Ho Pui-yin proposed that more photos could be used for showing the unearthed discoveries for easy understanding by the Members in future meetings, and that it would be better to have a plan showing all the discoveries in different parts of the archaeological works areas. Dr Liu Wensuo agreed to follow up accordingly.

Opening Remarks

10. The Chairman welcomed Members and representatives from

government bureau and departments to the meeting. He introduced to Members Ms Michelle Li, Director of Leisure and Cultural Services, and Miss Leonie Lee, Assistant Secretary (Heritage Conservation)³ of the Development Bureau (DEVB), who attended the meeting for the first time.

11. At the invitation of the Chairman, Ms Michelle Li said that she was delighted to attend the board meeting for the first time since she took up her new post in mid-July 2014. Noting the increase in public awareness and expectation on heritage conservation issues in Hong Kong, she trusted that the AAB would serve as a platform for open, professional and in-depth discussions on heritage conservation issues from different perspectives. The recent consultation document on the Review of Policy on Conservation of Built Heritage also provided a good opportunity to facilitate public understanding and informed discussion. Regarding the preservation of archaeological discoveries at the works site of the To Kwa Wan Station of the Shatin to Central Link, she learnt from a recent site visit the difficulties of conducting archaeological works, the tight schedule and the need to balance diverse interests. She hoped that the concerned parties would all work together and do their best to complete the upcoming tasks. The Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) would continue to work closely with the DEVB on heritage conservation and she welcomed Members' comments and advice in this regard.

**Item 1 Confirmation of Minutes of the AAB Special Meeting held on 29 May 2014 and the 167th Meeting held on 4 June 2014
(Board Minutes AAB/10/2013-14 and AAB/11/2013-14)**

12. The minutes of the AAB Special Meeting held on 29 May 2014 and the 167th Meeting held on 4 June 2014 were confirmed without amendment.

**Item 2 Matters Arising and Progress Report
(Board Paper AAB/39/2013-14)**

13. Mr Tom Ming reported that the progress of major projects in respect of historic buildings and structures, archaeological work and educational programmes had been detailed in the relevant Board Paper. The archaeologists responsible for the excavation at the works site of the To Kwa Wan Station of the

Shatin to Central Link had just briefed Members on the latest progress of the project.

14. Regarding historic buildings, Mr Tom Ming supplemented that three historic temples, being administered by the Chinese Temples Committee, were approved by the Chief Executive for declaration as monuments. The Antiquities and Monument Offices (AMO) was proceeding with the necessary procedures for gazettal. He also reported that one of the “dragon poles” in front of the Hung Shing Temple in Ap Lei Chau fell down when Typhoon Kalmaegi hit Hong Kong. Luckily no one was injured. AMO was following up with the repair works.

**Item 3 Heritage Impact Assessment in respect of the Revitalisation of the Bridges Street Market
(Board Paper AAB/40/2013-14)**

15. The Chairman introduced the presentation team comprising the following members:

Ms May Chan Suk- mei,
Vice-Chairman,
Hong Kong News-Expo

Prof Bernard V Lim,
Principal,
Architecture Design and Research Group

Mr Eugene Chung,
Assistant Principal,
Architecture Design and Research Group

Mr Brian Anderson,
Partner,
Purcell

16. Ms May Chan briefed Members on the background of the revitalisation project of converting the Bridges Street Market (BSM) into “The Hong Kong News-Expo” (the News-Expo) and showed Members a video presenting the aims

and purposes of the project.

17. Prof Bernard Lim then briefed Members on the site plan, cultural significance and character-defining elements of the BSM. He also explained in detail the design proposal, result of the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) for the project and the proposed mitigation measures.

18. The Chairman declared that he was an ex-Member of the Advisory Committee on Revitalisation of Historic Buildings and had taken part in the approval of the revitalisation project for the BSM.

19. Mr Stephen Chan expressed that Central and Western District Council (C&WDC) greatly supported this revitalisation project, and considered that the site was suitable for converting into the News-Expo given its association with the history of Dr Sun Yat-sen and the newspaper industry in Central District. C&WDC would have further discussion on the project proposal, and hopefully this revitalisation project could be linked up with the revitalisation of the Former Police Married Quarters on Hollywood Road (PMQ), which was just opposite to the BSM. To accommodate the possible influx of visitors, it was suggested to provide an additional disabled access at another entrance, apart from the new disabled entrance currently proposed to be built on the G/F facing Shing Wong Street. Besides, the greening arrangement could be enhanced at the stairs landing at Shing Wong Street after the demolition of the existing Refuse Collection Point (RCP). Prof Bernard Lim responded that the arrangement of disabled access as well as other local facilities could be further discussed at the coming C&WDC meeting.

20. In response to Ms Janet Pau's questions on the selection and presentation of old news materials, as well as the presentation of the future development of Hong Kong media in the News-Expo, Ms May Chan elaborated that selection of critical incidents in Hong Kong was being conducted and news reports of selected incidents from diversified sources would be collected, with the assistance from professors and university students of Journalism and History disciplines. The consolidated information would then be factually presented to visitors by digital media device on the G/F to facilitate comprehension of the incidents from all angles, which could enhance the visitors' understanding of Hong Kong's history. In collaboration with the Hong Kong Jockey Club and different schools, media workshops would be arranged in the multi-purpose room

on the 1/F for educating students of the different ways of news reporting by interactive multimedia. Talks by experienced journalists on topics related to media development would also be conducted.

21. Sr Wong Bay declared interest that he worked as a maintenance surveyor for three years in Central and Western District in the 1970s. He hoped that skilled workers could be employed for retaining the Shanghai Plaster finishes. He also proposed to have further thought on the lift design so as to match with the simple architecture of BSM. The Chairman supplemented that the possible impact of the reflection to the residents in Wing Lee Street should be addressed if glass was used for the lift design. Prof Bernard Lim responded that the new design would echo with the outward appearance of BSM as far as possible, in particular the horizontal-lined features.

22. Ms Lilian Law proposed that human factors such as “passion” and “feelings of adolescents” could be featured by including some human stories related to the newspaper industry. Ms May Chan responded that oral history, including human stories, was being collected from the veterans in the newspaper industry or their descendants. Besides, the information to be displayed would be updated at regular intervals, subject to the views collected from the students during the secondary school visits to be conducted periodically in future.

23. Regarding Prof Ho Pui-yin's suggestion to include in the exhibition the history of BSM itself and Prof Chung Po-yin's suggestion to provide information about the development of Hong Kong media and its influence on Chinese societies (through influential authors, columnists and reporters and modes of operation of the industry, etc.), instead of the history of Dr Sun Yat-sen and summary of old news (which were already available in libraries), Ms May Chan explained that the requirement to highlight the history of Dr Sun Yat-sen and the evolution history of the BSM site in the display was specified in the revitalisation project invitation for proposal issued by the DEVB, and their documentaries would be played continuously at the ex-market stalls near the entrance of the News-Expo. Information on the history of poultry scalding, Avian Influenza and public health would also be displayed at the preserved poultry scalding room.

24. Prof Ho Puay-peng suggested revisiting the correlation between the interpretation area and the ex-market stalls on the G/F and reviewing the lift design so as to match with the horizontal-lined feature of BSM. Apart from

seeking confirmation as to whether some portions of the outward appearance of the building would be colored, he opined that the availability of a perspective highlighting the areas to be preserved or demolished together with the explanatory notes would facilitate better understanding of AAB Members. Prof Bernard Lim responded that the suggestions were agreeable and he would further discuss with the exhibits designer on the interface of the displayed items and the lift design would also be refined to take into account the comments made by Members. He supplemented that while some portions near the entrance or the architectural fins might be colored, most of the original features would be preserved. The HIA report had provided an inventory setting out the items to be preserved or demolished together with the reasons for doing so.

25. Ms Ava Tse pointed out that the new glazed entrance was not compatible with the preserved outward appearance of BSM. Prof Bernard Lim agreed and they would consider other alternatives, such as a collapsible gate.

26. Prof Billy So suggested that the News-Expo should have a clearer theme so that visitors could have clear expectation before the visit. Also a clearer definition on “what was Hong Kong news” was needed. Besides, information on how the published newspapers were reused in daily life in the past should be included in the themed display. Ms May Chan explained that the themes of the News-Expo would focus on both the development of Hong Kong through media reports as well as the development of the media itself. She would discuss with her team of professionals the definition of “Hong Kong news”. She said that how published newspapers would be reused would also be included as part of the documentation in the future display.

27. Dr Winnie Tang declared that she had worked with Prof Bernard Lim when they both served on the Town Planning Board. She pointed out that a data centre/server room together with a wireless network at the News-Expo would be required if the information would mainly be displayed by means of interactive multi-media devices. Such provision was not shown in the current project proposal and advance planning would be required as this would affect the layout design of the News-Expo. Prof Bernard Lim and Ms May Chan responded that a small server room had been allowed in the building plan, and they would approach information technology (IT) experts for advice in the planning process.

28. Mr Conrad Wong suggested that the display could include

documentations on the personal history of people in the industry who had sacrificed their lives. Ms May Chan replied that such information would be included in the future display.

29. Given the presentation by the project team and views expressed by Members, the Chairman concluded that the AAB was generally supportive of the findings of the HIA and further consultation with the AAB would not be necessary.

Item 4 Assessment of Historic Buildings (Board Paper AAB/41/2013-14)

30. Mr Tom Ming began the discussion by briefing Members on the categorisation of the items listed at Annexes A to C of the board paper. The proposed grading of all the items listed at Annex A were confirmed as Members raised no comment on the assessment.

31. Regarding Annex B, Mr Tom Ming reported that AMO received a suggestion from the Hong Kong Golf Club to upgrade the Clubhouse from Grade 2 to Grade 1. The Assessment Panel considered that the information provided could not substantiate the upgrading proposal and hence maintained their views that the building be recommended a Grade 2 status.

32. Mr Philip Liao declared interest as he was a member of the Hong Kong Golf Club, while his business partner and her husband were past and present captains of the Hong Kong Golf Club. Although he would not take part in the discussion, he enquired if additional photos of the building could be shown to facilitate Members' reviewing of the grading.

33. Mr Tom Ming responded that Members should review the grading by taking into account the new information provided in the letter of Hong Kong Golf Club, and whether the new information was sufficient for amending the grading recommended. After deliberation, Members agreed to maintain the original decision of according Grade 2 to the building.

34. Separately, Mr Tom Ming advised Members that two letters from the public had been received to suggest reviewing of the heritage value of the stone

house at No. 4, Tai Koon Yuen, Diamond Hill, Kowloon (also known as 喬宏故居) which was accorded nil grade by AAB on 31 August 2010 under the assessment of the 1,444 buildings. After reviewing the recent suggestion, the Assessment Panel maintained their views that the building be recommended a nil grade status.

35. The Chairman emphasised that public consultation had been conducted before the nil grade for the stone house was confirmed. The confirmed grading should be amended only if relevant new information was actually available. After consideration of the background of the building and the information lately provided, Members agreed that the original grading should remain unchanged.

36. Dr Alan Fung then gave a presentation of the 9 new items listed at Annex C. Prof Ho Pui-yin, Mr Kenny Lin and the Chairman enquired about the reason for according Grade 3 status to the ‘old quarry site structures at Lei Yue Mun’. Mr Tom Ming explained that this quarry was indeed the first quarry submitted for grading consideration. Dr Alan Fung supplemented that it was the main supplier of crushed stones for the construction industry in Hong Kong before the reform and opening-up of the Mainland. In addition, it was the only stone quarry with various structures to fully demonstrate the production process of crushed stones.

37. Sr Wong Bay said that stone quarries were important boosters to the development of the Hong Kong economy and construction industry. Besides, crushed stones were important ingredients for reinforced concrete which was widely used in post-War period, and hence the quarry should be preserved.

38. Ms Janet Pau asked for the possible effect on the future grading assessment of quarries of similar nature, such as the ‘Si Shan’ (四山, ‘Four Hills’), which was well-known for stone production. Besides, Ms Lilian Law wanted to obtain more information on the social value and rarity of the quarry.

39. Prof Ho Puay-peng considered that the quarry was of high group value. Mr Philip Liao echoed that the quarry had high group value and wanted to know the boundary of this item in assessing the quarry as a whole. In addition, Prof Chung Po-yin viewed the proposed Grade 3 status was too low, having regard to the important role of stone-cutting workers and the associated community within the ‘Si Shan’.

40. In response to the Chairman's enquiry on whether there were exigencies to accord grading to this quarry. Mr Tom Ming said that some dilapidated structures at the quarry were in need of repair. Concerning the boundary of this site, it was in general referring to the plan formed by the 13 structures identified there. After taking account of the above discussion, the Chairman asked AMO to provide supplementary information on industrial heritage and background information of 'Si Shan' to facilitate Members' deliberation of the grading of this item. Grading assessment for this item would therefore be deferred.

41. As regards the case of the former Yuen Long Public Middle School at No. 3 Yau Shin Street, Au Tau, Yuen Long, Prof Ho Puay-peng opined that this building had high architectural and historical value and that the proposed grading should be upgraded to from Grade 3 to Grade 2. Ms Lilian Law echoed the upgrading proposal. Dr Alan Fung added that the building was the first government secondary school in the New Territories and had set the precedent of using matching fund for subsidising the construction of village schools.

42. Referring to No. 118 Wellington Street, Central, Mr Philip Liao asked if the architectural features could be protected after grading. Ms Lilian Law also enquired if the building could be preserved after grading as it was within the Urban Renewal Authority (URA) project area. The Chairman clarified that the grading system was only an administrative measure.

43. Prof Ho Puay-peng reported on behalf of Mr Stephen Chan that C&WDC supported the preservation of features of this building due to its historical value, and the C&WC had no objection for the descendants of the calligraphist to ask for re-possession of the calligraphy on the balcony from URA. At this juncture, Mr Philip Liao declared interest that he was a Non-executive Director (non-official) of URA.

44. Prof Ho Puay-peng and Sr Wong Bay viewed that the calligraphy, staircase, polished terrazzo and cantilevered structure were the most valuable features of the building.

45. With the above comments and noting that the grading of the old quarry site structures at Lei Yue Mun would be deferred, Members supported the upgrading of the former Yuen Long Public Middle School at No. 3 Yau Shin Street,

Au Tau, Yuen Long from Grade 3 to Grade 2 and confirmed the proposed grading of the remaining 7 new items listed at Annex C for proceeding with the one-month public consultation.

Item 5 Any Other Business

46. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:44 p.m.

Antiquities and Monuments Office
Leisure and Cultural Services Department
December 2014

Ref: LCSD/CS/AMO 22-3/1