MEMORANDUM FOR THE ANTIQUITIES ADVISORY BOARD

ASSESSMENT OF HISTORIC BUILDINGS

PURPOSE

This paper invites Members to consider the grading proposal of the six items set out in paragraphs 3 to 9, and endorse the way forward for the grading assessment arrangements set out in paragraphs 10 to 13 below.

BACKGROUND

2. As at the meeting held on 8 December 2016, Members have endorsed the grading of 1 342 buildings as follows:

- (a) 172 buildings with Grade 1 status;
- (b) 363 buildings with Grade 2 status;
- (c) 495 buildings with Grade 3 status;
- (d) 294 buildings with no grading; and
- (e) 18 buildings with no further processing due to their demolition or substantial alteration.

ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

3. At the meeting on 8 December 2016, Members endorsed the proposed grading of the building remains at the site of Cochrane Street, the former State Theatre, and No. 27 Lugard Road as listed at <u>Annex A</u>. Following the established practice, a one-month public consultation on the proposed grading of the three items was subsequently carried out. All written submissions on the proposed grading of the three items received during the

public consultation period have been passed to Members for consideration before the meeting. The number of submissions and their stance on the proposed grading are set out in the ensuing paragraphs.

Building Remains at the Site of Cochrane Street, Central (first item listed at <u>Annex A</u>)

4. On the proposed Nil Grade status of the building remains at the site of Cochrane Street, 500 written submissions were received during the public consultation period, with two supports, 497 objections (comprising 473 standard petition letters) and one without indicating its preference¹.

Former State Theatre, North Point (second item listed at <u>Annex A</u>)

5. On the proposed Grade 1 status of the former State Theatre, 133 written submissions were received during the public consultation period, with 102 supports (comprising 58 standard petition letters), 23 objections and eight without indicating their preference².

No. 27 Lugard Road, The Peak (third item listed at <u>Annex A</u>)

6. On the proposed Grade 1 status of No. 27 Lugard Road, four written submissions were received during the public consultation period, with two supports, one objection and one without indicating its preference.

Confirmation of Grading for Cases where Objection(s) have been Received

7. As at 8 December 2016, under the list of 1 444 historic buildings, there are 97 buildings of which proposed grading has been endorsed by the Board but not yet confirmed due to objection(s) received during the public

¹ After the public consultation period, 52 comments, all being standard petition letters objecting the proposed grading of the building remains, were received.

 $^{^{2}}$ After the public consultation period, 27 comments were received, with 16 supports (comprising 13 standard petition letters), ten objections and one without indicating its preference.

consultation carried out back in 2009. The grading system is administrative in nature and it does not affect the ownership, usage, management and development rights of the owners concerned. With a view to better recognising the heritage value of these historic buildings, and wrapping up the grading of the list of 1 444 historic buildings, the Antiquities and Monuments Office ("AMO") will continue to invite the Board to review and confirm the proposed grading of those buildings which have been objected, having regard to the circumstances of individual cases.

The Sanctuary and Bell Tower of Union Church, No. 22A Kennedy Road, Central (first and second items listed at <u>Annex B</u>)

8. The Sanctuary and Bell Tower of Union Church were both proposed a Grade 3 status by the Board in March 2009. However, objection from the owner was received during public consultation. The relevant objection letters and replies have been passed to Members for consideration before the meeting. Given the Union Church has obtained a planning approval for redevelopment which suggests that there may be demolition threat to the two items, Members are invited to confirm the proposed grading of the Sanctuary and Bell Tower of Union Church, with a view to facilitating the Government to discuss preservation-cum-development options with the owner.

No. 2 First Street, Tai Wai, Sha Tin (third item listed at Annex B)

9. No. 2 First Street was proposed a Grade 3 status by the Board in March 2009. However, objection from the owner was received during public consultation. The relevant objection letter and reply have been passed to Members for consideration before the meeting. In the light of the redevelopment application for No. 2 First Street received by the Lands Department, which suggests that there may be demolition threat, Members are invited to confirm the proposed grading of No. 2 First Street, with a view to facilitating the Government to discuss preservation-cum-development options with the owner.

UPDATED LIST OF 1 444 HISTORIC BUILDINGS AND RATIONALISATION OF THE LIST OF NEW ITEMS AND NEW CATEGORIES

10. As mentioned in paragraph 7 above, under the list of 1 444 historic buildings, the proposed grading of 97 items is pending confirmation owing to objection(s) received during the public consultation carried out back in 2009. The latest position of the list of 1 444 historic buildings is at <u>Annex C</u>.

11. As per the prevailing practice, the public may also make suggestions for grading assessment since 2009, which make up the list of new items and new categories. Among the 267 items on the list of new items and new categories, grading of 99 items have been confirmed by the Board. With a view to expediting the grading assessment of the outstanding items, AMO has critically reviewed the list of new items and new categories and suggests to rationalise them by splitting into two lists, i.e. (a) list of new items for grading assessment (Annex D); and (b) list of items not falling under the usual category of "buildings/structures" and will not be further processed for grading assessment (Annex E).

UPDATED POSITION OF HISTORIC BUILDINGS DEMOLISHED AND SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED

12. In the past four years, 17 historic buildings have been demolished. Breakdown of the grading status of these buildings is set out below:

- (a) Grade 1 historic building: 1
- (b) Grade 2 historic building: 3
- (c) Grade 3 historic building: 7
- (d) Nil Grade: 1
- (e) proposed Grade 2 historic building: 3
- (f) proposed Grade 3 historic building: 2

13. Meanwhile, two proposed Grade 3 historic buildings were found substantially altered. The Historic Buildings Assessment Panel has reviewed the proposed grading of these two items and considered that they do not warrant any further grading assessment since their heritage merits have been

significantly diminished. Having regard to the current status/conditions of these 17 demolished and two substantially altered items, it is suggested that their grading assessment should not be proceeded further.

ADVICE SOUGHT

- 14. Members are invited to:
 - (a) consider confirming the proposed grading of the items set out in paragraphs 3 to 9 above; and
 - (b) endorse the way forward for the grading assessment arrangements as set out in paragraphs 10 to 13 above.

Antiquities and Monuments Office Leisure and Cultural Services Department March 2017

Ref: LCSD/CS/AMO 22-3/0